

What evidence is needed to inform food retail policy in New York City?



Nicholas Freudenberg
Panel on Increasing Food Access through Policy and Advocacy
February 25, 2015

Goals for New York City food retail policies

- Make healthy food more available and affordable
- Ensure food safety
- Reduce hunger and food insecurity
- Promote development of food businesses and food employment
- Encourage local and regional food production
- Reduce promotion and availability of unhealthy

What evidence is needed to guide (retail) food policy in New York City?

- Distribution and changes in types of outlets (e.g., bodegas, supermarkets, farmers markets)
- Temporal and geographic variation in food sales by product and population
- Patterns of food consumption
- Receipt and use of food benefits such as SNAP and WIC
- Prevalence and incidence of hunger, food insecurity, obesity and diet-related diseases

Retail Food Outlets in East Harlem

Zip	Number of Licensed Retail Food Outlets	Farmers Markets	Food Establishments with Active Liquor Licenses
10029	135	4	140
10035	69	0	64
Total	204	4	204

From NY State Dept of Agriculture Databases

<https://data.ny.gov/Economic-Development/Retail-Food-Stores/9a8c-vfzj?>

Table 2. Store type by neighborhood

Neighborhood	Bodegas	Supermarkets	Specialty	Drug stores	Convenience stores	Total
Central Harlem	153 (65.4%)	19 (8.1%)	32 (13.7%)	14 (6.0%)	16 (6.8%)	234
East Harlem	174 (66.2%)	21 (8.0%)	34 (12.9%)	15 (5.7%)	19 (7.2%)	263
Upper East Side*	46 (33.1%)	26 (18.7%)	48 (34.5%)	18 (12.9%)	1 (0.7%)	139
Totals	373 (58.6%)	66 (10.4%)	114 (17.9%)	47 (7.4%)	36 (5.7%)	636

* Unlike East and Central Harlem, where the survey included all food stores located in these neighborhoods, the survey conducted on the Upper East Side included a sample of food stores.

Suggested citation: Gordon C, Ghai N, Purciel M, Talwalkar A, Goodman A. Eating Well in Harlem: How Available Is Healthy Food? New York, NY: New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, 2007.

In 2013, 11,629 households in East Harlem received an estimated total of \$38 million in SNAP benefits



EH residents spend \$339,690,627 on food, the largest single category of expenditures (at 12.7%). Currently \$90.4 million is spent in East Harlem- leaving a gap of \$249.4 million.

CB 11 Retail Corridor Study, 2011

Food labor



What are the most common food jobs?

Occupation	Est. Employment	Proj. Growth	Openings per Year	Median Wage
Food prep and serving workers	52,564	18%	2,120	\$18,520
Waiters and waitresses	50,276	12%	3,310	\$19,540
Cashiers	28,186	9%	3,710	\$18,960
Cooks, Restaurant	20,291	16%	940	\$27,630
Food prep workers	13,316	4%	1,010	\$25,010
Food prep and serving supervisors	12,625	12%	480	\$37,760
Stock clerks and order fillers	12,156	-2%	980	\$20,220
Dishwashers	11,949	9%	770	\$18,830
Counter attendants	9,649	10%	940	\$19,200
Dining room and cafeteria attendants	8,791	7%	520	\$18,550

SOURCE | NYSDOL, Staffing Patterns Matrix and Occupational Employment Projections

What would be impact of closing the 125th Street Pathmark?



How would closing of Pathmark affect availability of healthy food in East Harlem? Prices of healthy food?

What populations would be affected?

What should be the role of community residents in deciding what comes next?

What should be role of public officials and developers?

Five Supermarkets in East Harlem – Price Comparison of Staple Foods early 2015

Name of Supermarket	gallon whole milk	dozen eggs	Pound boneless skinless chicken breast	large bag of Lays Potato chips	loaf of Wonder White bread
Pathmark (125th and Lex)	3.99	2.99	4.54/lb	2.99	1.99
Wild Olive (125th and 5th)	3.99	n/a	n/a	4.29	n/a
Fine Fare (119th and 1st)	4.59	2.49	3.19/lb	2 for 6	2.59
Super Fi Emporium (103 rd Lex and 3 rd)	3.99	2.19	2.69/lb	4.29	1.99
Met Food/Key Food (110 th , Lex and 3 rd)	3.99	2.00	3.09/lb	1.99	2.29
Associated (116th and Lex)	2.19	1.66	1.99/lb	2.59	n/a

Community Survey on Pathmark

- 65 residents surveyed
- 75% say they shopped at Pathmark more than 6 times in past year
- 83% say developer should be required to include affordable supermarket that offers healthy food
- 83% say Pathmark has more or the same amount of healthy food options compared to other stores
- 82% say Pathmark has cheaper or same price of food compared to other stores
- 92% say Pathmark has better or the same quality of food compared to other stores
- 45% lived in 10029, 40% in 10035, 10% from elsewhere; 58% of responses were in English 42% were in Spanish

Surrounding Supermarkets in East Harlem

There are 13* supermarkets that fall within a 1-mile range of Pathmark in the East Harlem zip codes 10029 and 10035 and include:

- Aldi Supermarket
- Associated Market
- Associated Market
- Compare Foods
- Costco
- Fine Fare Supermarket
- Fine Fare Supermarket
- Met Food Market
- NYC Fresh Market
- Pioneer Supermarket
- Supermarket Incorporated
- Target

**Aldi, Costco and Target are located at the same address and Costco is membership only*



Impact of Business Fines and Fees on Food Retail

1. What fines and fees are being currently paid by grocery stores and street vendors of food? How are these fines and fees distributed by type and source of merchant and by administrative code or agency collecting fine or fee, and by geography? Are fines levied and fees charged actually collected?
2. What are the revenues generated by various categories of fines and fees and how have they changed over the last 5 years ?
3. What is correlation between types of fines assessed and collected and complaints about food businesses reported to 311, city's complaint line?
4. What are perceptions of impact of varying fees and fines by stakeholders in this process including retailers, distributors, business leaders, city officials, and community organizations?

Possible sources of data for study of fines and fees

- City records of fine levied and collected by agency, violation, type of outlet and zip code
- Records of fees by agency and outlet
- **Interviews and focus groups** with key stakeholders including owners of grocery stores and street carts and trucks, members of trade associations, leaders of BIDs, officials and staff of enforcement agencies, staff of elected officials
- Review of practices in other jurisdictions

Our questions for you

What other evidence should we consider in examining impact of closure of Pathmark?
of fines and fees?

How can food store owners, healthy food advocates and researchers better collaborate to identify needs for evidence to inform policy?

Send us your suggestions:

nfreuden@hunter.cuny.edu